

Background Research – Independent Remuneration Panel

In December 2018, Rushcliffe Borough Council commissioned its independent panel to carry out a review of Members' Allowances. The panel comprised the chair, Stuart Leslie, former Director of Legal and Democratic Services at Derby City Council; Richard Dix, former chief executive of Newark and Sherwood District Council; and a new member, John Flowers who had been part of Gedling Borough Council's IRP for a number of years.

The Panel met on two occasions to review background and comparative information; they spoke with, or received written correspondence from, eleven Councillors; and were advised by the Council's Section 151 Officer, the Monitoring Officer and the Service Manager – Finance and Corporate Services.

The Panel recommended:

- That the basic allowance remain unchanged but that it be increased annually in line with the percentage pay award made to officers
- That there be no changes to the special responsibility allowances but that they be increased annually in line with the percentage pay award made to officers
- That the travel and subsistence allowances remain unchanged.

These recommendations were accepted at Council on Thursday 7 March 2019.

Given the period of time that has elapsed since the last full review of allowances and the impending Borough Council election next year, it is considered to be an opportune time to carry out another full review of the allowances scheme.

This document contains financial information which enables comparison between the Councillors' Allowances Scheme at Rushcliffe Borough Council to be made with other neighbouring similar authorities. Because of the nature of this information, which has mainly been sourced via councils' websites, some is from 2020/21 and some from 2021/22.

Basic Allowance

Commentary: When looking at the Basic Allowance per authority (going from largest to smallest) Bolsover is at the top with £9,902.40 and Broxtowe is at the bottom with £3,843.96. Rushcliffe is sixth out of fifteen (when listed from largest to smallest). When looking at the Total Spent on Basic Allowances per authority (going from largest to smallest) Bolsover is at the top with £353,212.22 and Melton is at the bottom with £14,1979.8. Rushcliffe is fifth from the top – five out of fifteen.

Name of authority	Number of Councillors	Basic Allowance per Councillor	Total Spent on Basic Allowances
Rushcliffe	44	£5,757.01	£253,308.44
Ashfield	35	£6,901.68	£241,558.80
Bassetlaw	47	£4,743.96	£222,966.12 ¹
Broxtowe	48	£3,843.96	£186,225.22 ²
Gedling	41	£4,380.60	£179,604.60
Newark and Sherwood	39	£5,124.00	£199,836.00
Mansfield ³	37	£6,385.92	£236,279.04
Charnwood ⁴	52	£5,318.04	£267,579.31
South Kesteven	56	£5,784.00	£319,435.87
NW Leicestershire	38	£5,115.07	£194,372.66
Melton	27	£5,122.86	£141,979.80 ⁵
Erewash	47	£4,320.72	£202,237.58 ⁶
Bolsover	37	£9,902.40	£353,212.22 ⁷
Chesterfield	48	£6,396.00	£307,008.00
Amber Valley	45	£4,210.00	£188,000.00 ⁸

¹ Two independent members receive a different basic allowance

² Three independent members receive a different basic allowance

³ Two independent members receive a different basic allowance

⁴ Six councillors only served part of the year

⁵ Three councillors received pro rata basic allowance

⁶ One councillor received pro rata basic allowance

⁷ One councillor received pro rata basic allowance

⁸ Two independent members receive a different basic allowance

Special Responsibility Allowances – Leader, Deputy leader, Cabinet members and Leader of the Opposition

Commentary: When looking at the Additional Allowance for the Leader per authority (going from largest to smallest) Chesterfield is at the top with £29,122.00 and Amber Valley is at the bottom with £12,632.00 (discounting Mansfield). Rushcliffe is sixth out of fourteen. When looking at the Additional Allowance for Deputy Leader per authority (going from largest to smallest) Chesterfield is at the top with £16,021.00 and Newark and Sherwood is at the bottom with £2,834.00 (again Mansfield is discounted from the comparison). Rushcliffe is near the middle – eighth out of fourteen.

Name of authority	Additional Allowance for Leader	Additional Allowance for Deputy Leader	Additional Allowance for Cabinet member	Additional Allowance for Leader of Opposition
Rushcliffe ⁹	£16,140.00	£9,549.00	£6,291.00	£5,196.00
Ashfield ¹⁰	£20,379.72	£15,298.32	£12,238.68	£5,099.40
Bassetlaw ¹¹	£13,430.04	£9,020.04	£5,741.04	-
Broxtowe	£19,679.04	£9,486.96	No Cabinet in 2021/22	£2,088.96
Gedling ¹²	£15,045.93	£12,036.74	£7,522.96	£5,016.22
Newark and Sherwood	£14,175.00	£2,834.00	No Cabinet in 2021/22	£4,906.00
Mansfield ¹³	£49,377.04 ¹⁴	£16,691.88 ¹⁵	£13,827.83	£988.45
Charnwood ¹⁶	£12,882.96	£9,017.04	£5,153.04	£4,319.04
South Kesteven ¹⁷	£20,235.00	£15,897.00	£11,562.00	£3,486.00
NW Leicestershire ¹⁸	£20,460.29	£12,787.68	£7,672.61	£5,115.07
Melton ¹⁹	£15,368.57	£10,245.72	£6,403.58	£2,090.96
Erewash ²⁰	£14,320.19	£8,592.12	£6,444.37	£5,579.77
Bolsover ²¹	£14,672.16	£9,781.44	£4,890.72	£4,890.72
Chesterfield ²²	£29,122.00	£16,021.00	£7,993.00	£9,105.00
Amber Valley ²³	£12,632.00	£6,316.00	£4,391.00	£3,158.00

⁹ Leader, Deputy Leader, and three additional members of Cabinet

¹⁰ Leader, two Deputy Leaders, and seven additional members of Cabinet

¹¹ Leader, Deputy Leader, and five additional members of Cabinet

¹² Leader, Deputy Leader, and six additional members of Cabinet

¹³ Executive Mayor, Deputy Mayor and three additional members of Cabinet

¹⁴ Discounted from comparison

¹⁵ Discounted from comparison

¹⁶ Leader, Deputy Leader, and eight additional members of Cabinet

¹⁷ Leader, Deputy Leader, and five additional members of Cabinet

¹⁸ Leader, Deputy Leader, and five additional members of Cabinet

¹⁹ Leader, Deputy Leader, and four additional members of Cabinet

²⁰ Leader, Deputy Leader, and five additional members of Cabinet

²¹ Leader, Deputy Leader, and six additional members of Cabinet

²² Leader, Deputy Leader, and eight additional members of Cabinet

²³ Leader, Deputy Leader, and three additional members of Cabinet

Special Responsibility Allowances – Chairmen and Vice Chairmen – Scrutiny

Commentary: When looking at the Total Cost of the Scrutiny SRA per authority (going from largest to smallest) Broxtowe is at the top with £44,908.90 and Amber Valley is at the bottom with £2,850.19. Rushcliffe is in the middle – eighth out of fifteen. When looking at the Average Cost per Position per authority (going from largest to smallest) Mansfield is at the top with £6,920.95 and Amber Valley is at the bottom with £1,425.10. Rushcliffe is still near the middle – ninth out of fifteen.

Name of authority	Scrutiny Group Chairmen	Scrutiny Group Vice-Chairmen	Total Cost of Scrutiny SRA	Average Cost per Position
Rushcliffe	4x £3,636	3x £1,212	£18,180	£2,597
Ashfield	1x £8,159.16 2x£6,119.28 1x£2,339.41	1x£3,059.64 2x£1,733.76 1x£3774.11	£33,038	£4,129.80
Bassetlaw	1x£3,177.96	1x£615	£3,792.96	£1,896.48
Broxtowe	2x£5,571.96 £5,089.92 4x£4,875.00 £3,917.14 £2,088.96	£1,605.96 £1,563.00	£44,908.90	£4,082.62
Gedling	£5,266.08 2x£3,761.48 £1,504.59		£14,293.63	£3,573.40
Newark and Sherwood	2x£5,777 2x£3,411	3x£1,065 2x£501	£22,573.00	£2,508.11
Mansfield	3x£6,920.95		£20,762.85	£6,920.95
Charnwood	£3,864.00 £3,142.29	£1,533.61 £861.23	£9,401.13	£2,350.28
South Kesteven	2x£5,784 £4,104.72 2x£3,855 £3,239.04	4x£1,908	£32,253.76	£3,425.37
NW Leicestershire	2x£5,113.06	-	£10,226.12	£5,113.06
Melton	£6,403.58	£2,090.96	£8,494.54	£4,247.27
Erewash	£3,792.35	£1,262.29	£5,054.64	£2,527.32
Bolsover	4x£3,260.52	4x£1,630.20	£19,562.88	£2,445.36
Chesterfield	3x£4,885.00	3x£1,629.00	£19,542	£3,257
Amber Valley	£2,246.19	£604.00	£2,850.19	£1,425.10

Special Responsibility Allowances – Chairmen and Vice Chairmen – Regulatory

Commentary: When looking at the Total Cost of the Regulatory SRA per authority (going from largest to smallest) Chesterfield is at the top with £29,356.00 and Amber Valley is at the bottom with £8152.00. Rushcliffe is second from the bottom – eighth out of nine. When looking at the Average Cost per Position per authority (going from largest to smallest) Mansfield is at the top with £6597.65 and Amber Valley is at the bottom with £1630.40. Rushcliffe is seventh out of nine.

Note: six authorities have been discounted from the comparison exercise on the basis that their regulatory positions are so different from Rushcliffe's that comparisons are difficult to draw.

Name of authority	Planning Committee Chairman	Planning Committee Vice-Chairman	Other	Total Cost of Regulatory SRA	Average Cost per Position
Rushcliffe	£5,352	£2,676	Standards - £1,332 Licensing - £1,332	£10,692	£2,673
Ashfield	£8,159.16	£3,659.92	Audit - £4,079.52 Standards and Personnel Appeals - £4,079.52 Licensing - £4,079.52	£24,057.64	£4,811.53
Bassetlaw	£3,177.96	£1,128.00 ²⁴	Audit [C] - £3,177.96 Audit [VC] - £615 Licensing [C] - £2,153.04 Licensing [VC] - £410.04 Additional but undefined allowances - £11,101.02	-	₂₅
Broxtowe	£5,098.92	£696.96	Licensing - £278.04 Additional but undefined allowances - £10,510.60	-	₂₆
Gedling	£5,266.08		Standards - £1,504.59 Plus around £50,000 undefined allowances	-	₂₇
Newark and Sherwood	£5,777	£1,065	Unclear from the website	-	₂₈

²⁴ In addition, 8 members of the planning committee are paid £717.96

²⁵ Excluded from calculation due to significant differences making it difficult to compare like with like

²⁶ Excluded from calculation due to significant differences making it difficult to compare like with like

²⁷ Excluded from calculation due to significant differences making it difficult to compare like with like

²⁸ Excluded from calculation due to significant differences making it difficult to compare like with like

Appendix D

Mansfield	£9,587.85		Governance and Ethics - £2,700 Licensing - £7,505.10	£19,792.95	£6,597.65
Charnwood	£3,864.00	£1,547.04	Standards - £532.31 Licensing [C] - £2,576.04 Licensing [VCx2] - £773.04 Additional but undefined allowances - £2,000	-	_ ²⁹
South Kesteven	£5,205	£1,719	Licensing [C] - £3,180 Licensing [VC] - £1,050 Additional but undefined allowances - £14,381.84	-	_ ³⁰
NW Leicestershire	£5,113.06	-	Licensing [C] - £5,113.06 Audit & Governance [C] £5,113.06	£15,339.18	£5,113.06
Melton	£4,355.48	£1,283.85	Audit and Standards [C] £4,355.48 [VC] £1,283.85 Licensing [C] £4,355.48 [VC] £1,283.85	£16,917.99	£2,819.67
Erewash	£3,792.35	£1,262.29	Audit [C] £3,792.35 [VC] £1,262.29 Standards [C] £3,792.35 [VC] £1,262.29 Licensing and Public Protection [C] £3,792.35 [VC] £1,262.29	£20,218.56	£2,527.32
Bolsover	£4,890.72	£2,445.00	Licensing [C] £3,260.52 [VC] £1,630.20	£12,226.44	£3,056.61
Chesterfield	£5,912.00	£2,956.00	Licensing [C] £3,726.96 [VC] £3,008.04 Standards & Audit [C] £4,885 Appeals & Regulatory [C] £5,912 [VC] £2,956	£29,356.00	£4,193.71
Amber Valley	£2,526.00	£604.00	Governance & Audit [C] £1,674 Licensing [C] £1,674 Standards & Appeals [C] £1,674	£8,152.00	£1,630.40

²⁹ Excluded from calculation due to significant differences making it difficult to compare like with like

³⁰ Excluded from calculation due to significant differences making it difficult to compare like with like

Special Responsibility Allowances – Civic Dignitaries

Commentary: When looking at the Total Cost of the Scrutiny SRA per authority (going from largest to smallest) Rushcliffe is at the top with £9,363.00 and Charnwood is at the bottom with £1,570.35. When looking at the Deputy Mayor / Chairman per authority (going from largest to smallest) Ashfield is at the top with £4,647.72 and Chesterfield is at the bottom with £500.00. Rushcliffe has the second highest Deputy's Allowance.

Name of authority	Mayor / Chairman	Deputy Mayor / Chairman
Rushcliffe	£9,363.00	[2,976.00] ³¹
Ashfield	£8,098.08	£4,647.72
Bassetlaw	£7,979.00	£2,525.00
Broxtowe	£7,481.64	£2,488.84
Gedling	£5,642.23	£1,880.74
Newark and Sherwood	£3,360.00	£670.00
Mansfield ³²	£2,586.19	£1,065.30
Charnwood	£1,570.35	£930.84
South Kesteven ³³	-	-
NW Leicestershire	£5,115.07	£639.38
Melton	£5,122.86	£1,707.62
Erewash	£3,992.29	£1,329.30
Bolsover	£4,890.72	£1,630.20
Chesterfield	£6,211.00	£500.00
Amber Valley	-	-

³¹ Was not claimed in 2021/22 – Councillors can only claim one SRA

³² Civic roles in addition to Executive Mayor and Deputy

³³ Does not appear to be remunerated

Percentage of Councillors Receiving an SRA

Commentary: Rushcliffe has the second lowest percentage of councillors claiming a Special Responsibility Allowance.

Name of authority	Number of Councillors	Total Spent on Basic Allowances	Number of Special Responsibility Allowances	Total Spent on Special Responsibility Allowances	Percentage of Councillors Claiming a Special Responsibility Allowance
Rushcliffe	44	£253,308.44	20	£88,790.70	45.5%
Ashfield	35	£241,558.80	27	£212,745.60	77.1%
Bassetlaw	47	£222,966.12	27	£93,177.90	57.4%
Broxtowe	48	£186,225.22	28	£102,628.32	58.3%
Gedling	41	£178,775.33	26	£119,256.63	63.4%
Newark and Sherwood	39	£199,836.00	18	£60,024.92	46.2%
Mansfield	37	£236,279.04	19	£157,804.46	51.4%
Charnwood	52	£267,579.31	29	£98,175.97	55.8%
South Kesteven	56	£319,435.87	29	£153,731.65	51.8%
NW Leicestershire	38	£194,372.66	12	£100,917.98	31.6%
Melton	27	£141,979.80	25	£81,833.77	92.6%
Erewash	47	£202,237.58	30	£90,903.30	63.8%
Bolsover	37	£ 353,212.22	18	£81,797.02	48.6%
Chesterfield	48	£307,008.00	23	£148,060.23	47.9%
Amber Valley	45	£188,000.00	27	£58,000.00	60.0%

Ratio of SRA to Basic

Commentary: Rushcliffe has the fifth lowest ratio of Leader's Allowance to Basic Allowance, is tenth in terms of Leader to Deputy Leader allowances, and ninth in terms of Leader to Cabinet member ratio.

Name of authority	Additional Allowance for Leader	Additional Allowance for Deputy Leader	Additional Allowance for Cabinet member	Basic Allowance per Councillor	Ratio Leader vs Basic	Leader vs DL	Leader vs Cabinet Member
Rushcliffe	£16,140.00	£9,549.00	£6,291.00	£5,757.00	2.80	1.69	2.57
Ashfield	£20,397.72	£15,298.32	£12,238.68	£6,901.68	2.91	1.33	1.66
Bassetlaw	£13,430.04	£9,020.04	£5,741.04	£4,743.96	2.83	1.49	2.34
Broxtowe	£19,679.04	£9,480.96	No Cabinet in 2021/22	£3,843.96	5.12	2.08	-
Gedling	£15,045.93	£12,036.74	£7,522.96	£4,380.60	3.43	1.25	2.00
Newark and Sherwood	£14,175.00	£2,834.00	No Cabinet in 2021/22	£5,124.00	2.77	5.00	-
Mansfield ³⁴	£49,377.04	£16,691.88	£13,827.83	£6,385.92	7.73	2.96	3.57
Charnwood	£12,882.96	£9,017.04	£5,153.04	£5,318.04	2.42	1.43	2.50
South Kesteven	£20,235.00	£15,897.00	£11,562.00	£5,784.00	3.50	1.27	1.75
NW Leicestershire	£20,460.29	£12,787.68	£7,672.61	£5,115.07	4.00	1.60	2.67
Melton	£15,368.57	£10,245.72	£6,403.58	£5,122.86	2.30	1.50	2.40
Erewash	£14,320.19	£8,592.12	£6,444.37	£4,320.72	3.31	1.67	2.22
Bolsover	£14,672.16	£9,781.44	£4,890.72	£9,902.40	1.48	1.50	3.00
Chesterfield	£29,122.00	£16,021.00	£7,993.00	£6,396.00	4.55	1.82	3.64
Amber Valley	£12,632.00	£6,316.00	£4,391.00	£4,210.00	3.00	2.00	2.88
				Average	3.48	1.91	2.21
				Median	3.00	1.60	2.50

³⁴ Executive Mayor (and Deputy Mayor) – both non-Civic roles